

## IMPLEMENTING TEAM-BASED LEARNING THROUGH ONLINE TEAM-TEACHING MODE: THE CASE IN TEACHING SPEAKING FOR CAREER DEVELOPMENT CLASS

Aminah Suriaman<sup>1</sup>, Konder Manurung<sup>2</sup> and Abdul Kamaruddin<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup> Universitas Tadulako

amisuriaman@gmail.com<sup>1</sup>, [kondermanurung@gmail.com](mailto:kondermanurung@gmail.com)<sup>2</sup>,

abdul\_kamaruddin@untad.ac.id<sup>3</sup>

\*correspondence: amisuriaman@gmail.com

<https://doi.org/10.24071/lltc.2022.14>

received 21 November 2022; accepted 18 December 2022

### Abstract

This study investigated the implementation of Team-based learning (TBL) that was successfully implemented through online team-teaching in teaching Speaking in Career Development Class at a university level. The study implemented a mixed-methods case-study design. The results of the documents analysis show that the average score of the learners enrolled in the 2020 and 2021 academic years is A. It implies that the teaching and learning are successful. The analysis of the data of the interview and FGD was based on the four foundational practices of Team-Based Learning implementation. The results indicate that the success of the implementation of TBL is supported by the technique used to form the team or group, the involvement of the information and communication technology that permit the demonstration of both online and offline group discussions, and the availability of the team-teaching to provide rich feedback on the learners' problems. The findings imply that TBL implementation is also effective whether it is demonstrated online or offline and in a blended learning model. It also indicates that the more the feedback received from teachers as team-teaching, the more motivated the learners to discuss as teamwork.

**Keywords:** online team-teaching, speaking in career development, team-based learning.

### Introduction

In response to the demands of learning in the era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0, where the success of a teaching-learning process is measured by the achievement of the learning outcomes, schools and universities in Indonesia response the policy of the Indonesian government through the Minister of Education and Culture to implement online-based learning or e-learning-based learning where the proposed approaches are case methods and Project-Based Learning (PjBL) or Team-Based Learning (TBL) or the combination of both. Interestingly, this proposition could be fully implemented in the last two years because the world has been badly affected by Covid-19 diseases since the beginning of 2020. The implementation of the TBL method has been mostly demonstrated in a conventional

face-to-face teaching model but since the unavoidable widespread of Covid-19 diseases, it has to be done online or the combination of online and offline, blended learning, in the whole level of educations and the whole courses. This has been the case in the teaching of Speaking in Career Development class at the university where the present study was conducted. The class was taught by implementing TBL online team-teaching and the results are satisfactory.

The implementation of TBL provides learners with critical skills to solve problems. It is regarded as the foundation for the learners to get knowledge and skills through student center learning which engages the learners into contextual authentic activities [1–3]. It is argued that TBL serves as the basis of progressive education that attempts to engage learners in life-long learning and give them better knowledge and skills they need [1]. In addition, TBL is recognized as a student-centered approach that encourages students to study thoroughly, critically, and responsibly concerning their subject matter [2], and more importantly, it is highlighted that TBL engages learners holistically to produce knowledge and address issues using meaningful, real-world integrated activities [3,4].

The success in the implementation of the TBL is based on the shift of the teaching and learning activities from teacher to learners and the development of the self-managed learning teams [6,5]. The learners become more active during the teaching and learning activities both individually and in groups or team-works to deal with the real-life project that explicitly leads the learners to manage their learning [5]. Reference [6] argued that through TBL class, learners' comprehension and retention of information, critical thinking, and attitudes toward the course is increased. This leads TBL courses to enable students to develop a good comprehension of concepts, a sense of responsibility to and for their team, a genuine sense of the power of team interaction, ethical decision making, and enhanced work performance [7]. The learner's capability improvement through TBL class is achieved due to the four foundational practices of TBL before, while, and after teaching and learning process which are strategically forming permanent teams, ensuring students familiarity with course content, developing students' critical thinking skills by using carefully-designed in-class activities and assignment and creating and administering a peer assessment and feedback system [8]. The principles imply that the members of the group must have enough background knowledge and willingness to actively interact in the team or group. Therefore grouping techniques hold a significant role in TBL in any proposed class [6].

The implementation of TBL has been reported beneficial in language teaching globally [10–13]. Reference [12] argued that the application of TBL in language learning was inspired by the need to shift from teacher-centered teaching and learning to student-centered learning. The implementation of the TBL is also supported by the previously considered effective methodology in language teaching and learning method, Communicative Language Teaching Methodology [14] that emphasize the introduction of integrated project derived from the students' communicative needs. As has been previously argued that the implementation of TBL is effective in the teaching and learning process in general, in language teaching and learning it is also found out that TBL implementation can effectively develop learners' communicative competence through real-life projects [15] where learners' interact actively with each other as a team. In addition, the planned project has to be

based on learners' needs so that the learners are motivated to interact with each other as a team [4,16].

Information and communication technology has been involved to support the implementation of TBL in language teaching and learning. The involvement of the technology has contributed enormously to language teaching and learning that makes the project becomes content-based activities [17] and contextual [18]. It is depicted that the presence of technology in language learning facilitates language learning to be dynamic where the technology enables the language learners to learn collaboratively with their peers at any time [19]. To support the contribution of the technology in the implementation of TBL, the role of the teacher holds paramount importance. The TBL teachers have the responsibility to ensure the development of the ability of the learners to work effectively and independently. Reference [20] described that the teacher in the implementation of the TBL has the responsibility to create self-managed teams by providing resources, using group tasks, and ensuring the availability of incentives for learners to prepare for and participate in group activities where the emphasis of the TBL class is on the development of language form and not on subject matter and skills. This is in line with [21–23] that highlight the role of the teacher to create independent learning habits for language learners by training them to use effective language learning strategies.

Although some research in the implementation of PBL has been conducted in language teaching, only a few if any research emphasizes the implementation of TBL in the online team-teaching model. It is found out, however, that team-teaching has been practiced in the educational system by using the TBL method or any other implemented teaching methods traditionally with a single teacher but in recent years TBL method is practiced in a team-teaching model where two or more teachers share the class [24]. The team-teaching mode has been introduced as one of the examples of co-teaching to enrich the teaching variation where it increases instructional option, program intensity, and continuity, reduce stigma for students with special needs, and increases support for teacher and related services [25]. The implementation of team-teaching has been increasingly demonstrated in the classroom face-to-face teaching due to its contribution not only on the effectiveness of the achievement of the instructional objectives but also the variation in the provision of the classroom activities [26]. The implementation of team-teaching has been regarded as the ability to offer multiple learning perspectives for both language learners and teachers [27]. It is also revealed that another contribution of the implementation of the team-teaching is to reduce teaching redundancy [28], and interestingly it is argued that the team-teaching model promotes teamwork and communication between teachers [26] which is beneficial in the implementation of TBL.

Considering the significant contribution of TBL and the team-teaching in the teaching and learning process that has been mostly reported in face-to-face conventional teaching, the present study proposes research question as follows: How to implement Team-Based Learning through online team-teaching mode in teaching speaking in career development? The research question has been proposed due to the successful implementation of the TBL in the online team-teaching in the teaching of Speaking in Career Development Class during Pandemic Covid-19 diseases where the teaching is conducted online.

## Method

The current study employed a mixed-methods case-study design to answer the research questions. The case-study design allowed for a more in-depth examination of various cases of different phenomena based on the context and needs of the investigation [29]. As part of the mixed-methods case-study design, the quantitative and qualitative data were collected in this study to meet the objective of the study. The setting of the present study was in the English Department at Tadulako University Palu, Indonesia offering a class entitled Speaking in Career Development as an elective course beginning from 2019/2020 academic year. The method implemented in teaching the class was the Team-Based Learning (TBL) method. The successfulness of the conduct of the teaching and learning in the newly programmed elective course triggers the conduct of the present study that aims to explore the implementation of TBL through an online team-teaching model.

The quantitative data were obtained through documents, the score of the learners who enrolled in Speaking in Career Development Class in two different academic years (2019/2020 and 2020/2021) that were obtained from the English department. Whereas the qualitative data were collected through open-ended interviews and Focus Group Discussion (FGD). The interview was conducted with the team-teaching who taught the class in the two academic years. The interview with one of the members of the team-teaching was conducted via telephone call and the other member of team-teaching was done face-to-face. The FGD was attended by the representatives of the learners from two different academic years which consisted of 9 learners drawn following the snowball technique. The participants were invited to participate in the FGD voluntarily which indicated their agreement to share opinions and data needed to support the objective of the present study. The participants of the FGD were chosen based on [30] who argue that the optimum size for a focus group is six to eight participants (excluding researchers), but focus groups can work successfully with as few as three and as many as 14 participants [30].

The FGD and interviews were focused on how the achievement of the learner achieved based on both teachers' and learners' experiences and opinions. The interview was done with the teacher and the FGD were attended by the learners. The FGD was mainly focused on team formation, course content, teaching activities and assignments, and feedback. The interview was focused on how the learners as a team participated during the teaching and learning process based on the teacher's experiences and opinions. Notes were taken during the interview and FGD and they were also recorded to ensure complete information for analysis to satisfy the objective of the present study. The FGD's participants are allowed to express themselves one participant at a time, to permit the identification of the speakers for transcription and analysis. During the FGD, two of the three researchers were present as observers to take notes to complement the results of the recording [31]. The analysis of the data from the interview and FGD was based on content analysis based on the four foundational Practices of Team-Based Learning implementation; 1) strategically forming permanent teams; 2) ensuring students familiarity with course content by; 3) developing students' critical thinking skills by using carefully-designed, in-class activities and assignment; and 4) creating and administering a peer assessment and feedback system [8].

## Findings and Discussion

The findings are divided into three parts: First, we describe the results of the analysis of the documents on the score obtained by the learners who enrolled Speaking in Career Development class; Second, we present the results of the data analysis from the Focus Group Discussion (FGD); and Third, we present the results of the data analysis of the interview. The results of the data analysis from both the FGD and interview are to support the success of the implementation of the TBL on the online team-teaching model.

### *The Learners' Achievement after the Implementation of TBL*

Since the Speaking in Career Development course is offered as an elective course, the learners are given freedom whether to enroll in the course or not. Based on the data obtained from the documentation there were 15 (fifteen) learners who enrolled in the Speaking for Career Development class in 2019/2020 academic year. The achievement of the learners is described in Table 1. The Class is scored A (the score is between 86 and 100), A- (the score is between 81 and 85), B+ (the score is between 76 and 80), B (the score is between 71 and 75), B- (the score is between 66 and 70), and C (the score is between 61 and 65). A score under 61 was considered a failure in the class.

The data in Table 1 reveal that there are 9 (60%) learners who have scored A, 3 (20%) A-, 2 (13%) B+, and only 1 (6%) who is scored B. None of the learners is scored <61 which implies that the whole learner of 2019/2020 academic year passed the course. The results of the document analysis also show that there are 5 (five) learners enrolled in the Speaking in Career development Class in 2020/2021 academic year. The achievement of the learners is figured in Table 2.

The data in Table 2 reveal that the whole 5 (100%) of the learners are scored A. It means the whole learners passed the class. The findings imply that the implementation of team-based learning through an online team-teaching model is effective in the teaching of Speaking in Career Development Class. The results of the present study are in line with the results of the implementation of TBL in the teaching and learning process in general [11,22].

Table 1

No.	The Scores of the Learners in 2019/2020 Academic Year		
	Scores	Number of students	Percentage
1	A	9	60
2	A-	3	20
3	B+	2	13
4	B	1	0
Total		15	100

Table 2

No.	The Scores of the Learners in 2020/2021 Academic Year		
	Scores	Number of students	Percentage
1	A	5	100
Total		5	100

### ***The results of the Focus Group Discussion***

The Focus Group Discussion (FGD) was mainly focused on the role of the team-teaching in the implementation of Team-Based Learning (TBL) during online learning concerning; team formation, course content, teaching activities and assignment, and feedback. The importance of the data from FGD is expected to support the data that have been collected from documents as have been described in Tables 1 and 2.

Team formation is essential in TBL to ensure that the team can work effectively and independently. One of the main concerns of the TBL is to enable learners to learn effectively and build up independent learning habits and therefore the role of the teacher is significant to actualize the TBL efficacy. The followings are examples of students' responses regarding team formation.

“At the beginning, it was not sure how to choose our group members. But the way our teacher guided us by highlighting the importance of knowing the characteristics of classmates so that we can communicate easier, both online and offline, and work cooperatively, we then decided to choose the group members that have been familiar with us. By choosing our group members we had the responsibility to be able to work together.”

When it was argued that the teaching and learning process, the activities were held online due to the pandemic covid-19, it is found out that the presence of the information and communication technology has contributed to the possibility to demonstrate group discussion both online and offline using various platforms, as argued by the learners during FGD are as follows.

"We have known each other from the last two semesters so we have identified our team members that can afford both online and offline discussion. This has been one of the benefits of the teacher's guidance so that we were able to communicate independently by using an available platform that could be easily accessed from the place where we are living. One of the difficulties to communicate was that bad networking in particular for online activities, however since we were permitted to use any of the easily accessible platforms, such as WA, email, google meet, zoom, etc. the discussion on the assigned activities was going on well."

The feedback from the teacher as a team-teaching was the last point raised during FGD. The learners got the benefit of having the team-teaching because the learners could get rich feedback from the teachers. The teacher changes their role from teaching to facilitating. The following are the selected response of the learners regarding feedback during the online team-teaching model.

“We were able to communicate with teachers, the team-teaching, by directly calling or by sending a message via SMS, WA, or email. We were glad that the team-teaching provided us with opinions based on each of the team-teaching member's opinions and experiences. This team-teaching method has enriched our understanding of the teaching activities and the assigned tasks. The feedback that we received from the team-teaching encouraged us to work in our group. It helped us to be independent learners. The teachers become a facilitator in our learning or discussion activities”

The students' assertions aforementioned above indicate that the role of teacher or instructor in TBL is crucial and that both learners and teachers get benefit from the implementation of TBL. The implementation of the TBL therefore can be various based on the needs and the phenomena where the teaching and learning are demonstrated. This is in line with [20] arguing that the implementation of TBL creates classroom experiences that are much more enjoyable and productive for both instructor and their students because the students become partners in the learning process. The teachers or the instructor knows what is needed by their learners and consequently can provide suitable topics or instructional material. The benefit of selecting and developing suitable instructional materials for learners' needs has been argued to be beneficial and motivational for language learners [16, 4].

### ***The Results of Interview***

The open-ended interview was focused on how the learners as a team participated during the teaching and learning process during the implementation of TBL in the online team-teaching model. The interview was mainly focused on the role of the learners as a team in the implementation of Team-Based Learning (TBL) during online learning concerning; teamwork, course content, learning activities and assignment, and feedback. The importance of the data from the interview is to support the data from the FGD as the factors that support the success of the TBL implementation in an online team-teaching model.

Learners in TBL groups have to become self-managed teams. Each member of the group supports each other to complete any tasks assigned to the group and has good control over each member's activities and group activities. Since the implementation of the TBL is to build up teamwork habits, learners need guidance and therefore on this occasion, the role of the teacher is changed from teaching to facilitating. The teachers facilitate and monitor group work or discussion, particularly in the implementation of TBL in an online team-teaching model. The following is the response of one of the members of the team-teaching regarding learners' teamwork.

“At the beginning of the class, it seemed that team/group work had not been actualized since the learners were joining the class online. The learners seemed to work individually because each member of the group present their part from the assigned topic. Soon after a group completed a presentation, I provide them with feedback on how to avoid individual presentations when teamwork is assigned. I guide them to work together online and offline

employing accessible platforms and discussed their teamwork topic before an online class presentation. At this step, I was no longer teaching, but I was facilitating the learners.”

Instructional materials or project topics in TBL must be well developed and organized so that it will be easier to provide learners with feedback. The well-developed and managed instructional materials must be based on learners' needs so that the instructional materials can attract the learner's attention. The following are the response of the team-teaching regarding the instructional materials and learning activities.

"Since the course is related to career development and the learning outcomes of the course is to enable learners to speak in a career or professional job they are interested in after the completion of the program, the topics are selected around the ELT profession. The learners were given the freedom to access related topics from the internet since the service hours of the campus library are limited due to pandemic Covid-19 diseases. In general, the topics chosen by the learners were related to their interest and in this way, they were more motivated to speak."

Learning activities and assignments are among the factors indicating the successful implementation of TBL. The activities and assignments have to support the achievement of the learning outcomes and therefore they must be well constructed. Concerning the success of the implementation of the TBL in an online team-teaching, the activities and assignment in the class was arranged as follows, cited from the response of the team-teaching.

"All of the activities and assignments are done by the learners were taken into account to decide their final score and it was informed in the first meeting of the class in the introduction and the course contract. All of the activities and the assignment presented by the learners are scored on the way they use the language and not on the language form or on the content of the project. In this way, the learners train themselves to present oral language and examine their ability to comprehend what other people intend to inform when they hold a conversation. My role as a teacher is to ensure that the activities and the assessment are around the problem or the course learning outcomes."

The team-teaching assertion above indicates that the success of the implementation of the TBL in an online team-teaching model is supported by the role of the learners as individuals and as group members. The individual learners as well as the group member has the responsibility to manage the learning activities when it is assigned to study a particular topic and the same responsibility when it is assigned to study in a team/group. To be able to actualize a self-managed team, the role of the teacher cannot be neglected, the teacher has to become a facilitator [26]. The success of the implementation of TBL in an online team-teaching is also supported by the technique in the provision of the project topics. It must be based on the learner's needs [4] and learners' interests [18]. Concerning the activities and assignment, it is important not to put the scoring system heavily on the language



form and the project content but it would rather on the ability to use oral language in fluency and comprehensibility [20]. The point of view of the team-teaching is in line with [8] emphasizing that TBL groups have the potential to become self-managed teams as a result of a combination of complete control over its interactions and each activity and assignment are specifically developed and managed to provide immediate feedback on performance. If the instructor tells the groups how to do their assignment, the feedback will be available related to the assigned tasks. Members of a group that receives immediate and continual feedback, on the other hand, automatically and consistently engage in evaluating and enhancing their process while accomplishing their assignment responsibilities.

### **Conclusion**

The implementation of Team-Based Learning in an online team-teaching is effective in the teaching of Speaking in Career Development Class based on the achievement of the learners in two different academic years. The effective and successful implementation of Team-Based Learning is supported by the technique in forming the team/group, the development and design of the instructional material or the topic of the project, the development and the form of activities, and the technique in creating and administering assessment and feedback system. The learners are guided by the teachers when they form their team so that all group members get familiar with each other even though they mostly meet and discuss online. The development of the instructional materials or project is based on the learners' needs and interests that have been generated into the course learning outcomes. In this way, the learners are motivated to learn and actively participated in teamwork/group work. The development and the form of activities and the assessment are developed around the problems that are beneficial for the learners and that the role of the teacher to ensure that all members of the group do the same activities and assignments.

### **Acknowledgements**

Thanks and appreciation are addressed to The Ministry of Education and Culture, Research and Technology Directorate of Higher Education, for funding this study. Thanks should also be addressed to Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat Universitas Tadulako which has facilitated the research, the research team, the learners as the research respondents, and others for the constructive ideas in completing this research.

### **References**

- Kavlu, A. (2020). The effect of project-based learning on first-year undergraduate students in English for specific purposes (ESP) courses. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 10(4), 227-239.
- Anyushenkova, O. N., Digtyar, O. Y., Karpova, T. A., Voskovskaya, A. S., & Bottiglierio, F. (2020). Project-based learning (PBL) as a tool for teaching foreign languages to students of non-linguistic universities. *Revista Espacios*, 41(06).
- Chamot, A. U. (2005). Language learning strategy instruction: Current issues and research. *Annual review of applied linguistics*, 25, 112-130.

- Cope, B., & Kalantzis, M. (2013). "Multiliteracies": New literacies, new learning. In *Framing Languages and Literacies* (pp. 115-145). Routledge.
- Hancock, B., Ockleford, E., & Windridge, K. (2009). An introduction to qualitative research. The NIHR RDS EM/YH, 2007. Retrieved from [http://www.rds-yh.nihr.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/5\\_Introduction-to-qualitative-research-2009.pdf](http://www.rds-yh.nihr.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/5_Introduction-to-qualitative-research-2009.pdf), 4-37.
- Smith, B. N., Hornsby, J. S., & Kite, M. (2000). Broadening the business curriculum via a cross-disciplinary approach. *Education*, 120(4).
- Brumfit, C 1984. *Communicative methodology in language teaching*. Cambridge University press.
- Fried-Booth, D. L. (2002). *Project work*. Oxford University Press.
- Beckett, G.H. (2006). Project-based second and foreign language instruction: *Theory, research, and practice*, in: G.H. Beckett, P.C. Miller (Eds.), *Proj. Second Foreign Lang. Educ. Past, Present. Futur., Information Age Publishing, Inc*, 3-18.
- Beckett, G. H., & Slater, T. (2017). A synthesis of project-based language learning: Research-based teaching ideas.
- . 2018. Project-based learning and technology, *TESOL Encycl. English Lang. Teach.* <https://doi.org/doi:10.1002/9781118784235>.
- Beckett, G., & Slater, T. (Eds.). (2019). *Global perspectives on project-based language learning, teaching, and assessment: Key approaches, technology tools, and frameworks*. Routledge.
- Dionne, H., & Horth, R. (1994). Challenges of literacy & development in Rural Quebec. Chapter 17.
- Sibley, J., & Ostafichuck, P. (2014). *Team work that works: Guide to implementing team-based learning*. Stylus, Sterling.
- Richards, J. C. (2001). *Curriculum development in language teaching*. Cambridge university press.
- Sandholtz, J. H. (2000). Interdisciplinary team teaching as a form of professional development. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 39-54.
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, D. (2017). *Research design : Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Sage, Thousand Oaks.
- Andrews, K. (2005). Closing the gap: Helping students identify the skills employers want. *NACE Journal*, 64, 41-44.
- Manurung, K. (2015). Improving the speaking skill using reading contextual internet-based instructional materials in an EFL class in Indonesia. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 176, 44-51.
- Manurung, K. (2002). *Maximizing the use of language learning strategies in self-access centres* (Doctoral dissertation, La Trobe University).
- Cook, L., & Friend, M. (1995). Co-teaching: Guidelines for creating effective practices. *Focus on exceptional children*, 28.
- McInerney, M. J., & Fink, L. D. (2003). Team-based learning enhances long-term retention and critical thinking in an undergraduate microbial physiology course. *Microbiology education*, 4(1), 3-12.
- Fink, L.K. (2003). *Creating significant learning experiences: An integrated approach to designing college courses*. Jossey-Bass.

- Michaelsen, L. K., Davidson, N., & Major, C. H. (2014). Team-Based Learning Practices and Principles in Comparison With Cooperative Learning and Problem-Based Learning. *Journal on Excellence in College Teaching*, 25.
- Hartenian, L. S., Schellenger, M., & Frederickson, P. (2001). Creation and assessment of an integrated business course: One college's experience. *Journal of Education for Business*, 76(3), 149-159.
- Holt, M. (1994). Dewey and the "Cult of Efficiency": Competing ideologies in collaborative pedagogies of the 1920s. *Journal of Advanced Composition*, 73-92.
- Legutke, M., & Thomas, H. (1991). *Process and experience in the language classroom*. Longman.
- Sweet, M., & Michaelsen, L. K. (Eds.). (2012). *Team-based learning in the social sciences and humanities: Group work that works to generate critical thinking and engagement*. Stylus Publishing, LLC.
- Gay, L. R., & Diehl, P. L. (1992). *Research methods for business and management*. Macmillan Coll Division.
- McCormack, W. T., & Garvan, C. W. (2014). Team-based learning instruction for responsible conduct of research positively impacts ethical decision-making. *Accountability in Research*, 21(1), 34-49.