



<http://e-conf.usd.ac.id/index.php/ucpbi/UC>
Undergraduate Conference on ELT, Linguistics and Literature
English Language Education, Sanata Dharma University, Yogyakarta

DRAFTING AN OUTCOME-BASED EDUCATION TEXTBOOK INVENTORY: A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Vika Nirvana Aulia¹ and Ive Emaliana²

^{1,2}Brawijaya University, Indonesia

vikanirvana@student.ub.ac.id¹ and ive@ub.ac.id²

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.24071/uc.2021.20>

received 28 May 2021; accepted 14 October 2021

Abstract

Pre-service English Language teachers are responsible to prepare professional teaching and learning program in secondary schools in the future. An implicit part of the English teacher role is to build technology savvy, antiracist, and welcoming world, which reflected Outcome-based education (OBE) principles. Hence, the textbooks play as foundational components of most teaching and learning process. This article outlines the rationale for the evaluation of a textbook inventory for assessing dimensions of ICT based integration, intercultural communicative competence, and inclusion in relation to OBE principles for English textbooks. Using library research method, this study attempts to initiate an instrument development through examining 4 experts' theories in textbook analysis and OBE principles, namely Spady (1994), Cunningsworth (1995), Ur (1999), and Reiss (2005). The findings show that an appropriate textbooks evaluation instrument should follow content, language, and presentation. A robust discussion about those three main components is explained thoroughly in the discussion which ensures that the materials are aligned with OBE principles. Therefore, textbook inventory will provide a first step to transforming instructional materials in a way that is tangible, making the materials more welcoming to students while laying groundwork for more robust capacity to care for people from a wide array of backgrounds.

Keywords: OBE principles, textbook evaluation, textbook inventory

Introduction

Textbooks serve as a basis for learning of most teaching and learning process, as it takes important roles in English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teaching and learning. Charalambous (2011) mentions that textbooks are essential in EFL teaching and learning because they provide teachers and students with ready-made content, and in foreign language education, a textbook (Lee, 2013) plays a critical role. Furthermore, textbooks, according to Hutchinson & Torres (1994), can be quite useful in the development of new ideas. They claim that textbooks can assist instructors to cope with feeling of fear and risky change processes by displaying new or untested approaches, gradually emerging force, and providing scaffolding

on which educators might construct their own more inventive strategy. This is also true for pre-service English language teachers who are responsible to prepare professional teaching and learning program in secondary schools in the future.

For both teachers and students, the use of English textbooks is extremely important. It serves as a reference for teachers as they deliver content, as well as providing necessary feedback through different explanations and activities. Cunningsworth (1995) sees a textbook as a tool for presenting content, as well as a place for students to practice and engage in activities like vocabulary, pronunciation, grammar, listening, reading, speaking, and writing. In short, a textbook is beneficial in assisting teachers in implementing the curriculum since it is focused on the curriculum that is required, as well as offering instruction and opportunities for learners to learn. Moreover, according to Harmer (2007), the most important component of textbook usage is for teachers to aim to get learners involved in the topic they will be working with. Additionally, when selecting content for the need of EFL students, there are several factors to consider. According to Nunan (1988), materials are an important aspect of the course.

Since pre-service English teachers use textbooks in their classes, they can choose one that is suitable for their students. They must assess the textbook's feasibility and efficacy before deciding to use it in order to provide an entirely suitable and optimal solution to meet the needs of learners. In order to maintain an acceptable textbook, an evaluation should be undergone to determine its strengths and weaknesses. Besides, to satisfy the needs of the students, a textbook evaluation should be carried out in a methodical manner using precise methods developed by experts. Pre-service English Teacher should test textbooks for two purposes, according to Sheldon (1988). First and foremost, the assessment will assist the instructor or curriculum creator in making textbook selection decisions. In addition, evaluating a textbook's merits and flaws will familiarize the instructor with the book's likely flaws and strengths.

Pre-service English Teachers are responsible to evaluate textbook. In fact, to determine whether or not textbook is appropriate or not, there should be textbook evaluation. Evaluation is a dynamic process that determines whether or not a current technique is suitable and appropriate (Rea-Dickens and Germaine 1992). Moreover, Sheldon (1988) explains why textbooks should be evaluated. He claims that choosing an ELT textbook is often a major administrative and educational decision involving a lot of time, money, and even politics. Furthermore, textbook evaluation, according to Cunningsworth (1995) and Ellis (1997), allows educators to move beyond subjective assessments and get significant, reliable, methodical, and contextual perspectives into the general essence of textbook content. Several significances of textbook evaluation for pre-service teachers are revealed.

Brief Theories of Textbook Evaluation

Textbook evaluation, according to Hutchinson and Waters (1987), cited in Sheldon (1988), is essentially a simple, analytical "matching process: matching needs to available solution." The approach of determining which textbook to use based on the importance and worth of teaching and learning is known as textbook assessment. Textbook assessment, according to Tomlinson et al. (2001), is an integrated language practice in which instructors, managers, administrators, and content creators examine the impact of material on people who use it. Moreover,

according to McDonough and Shaw (2003), textbook assessment is a realistic and valuable procedure since it provides educator with an understanding of the materials' organizational values and assists them in maintaining the field's progress. In addition, Tomlinson and Masuhara (2004) claim that textbook evaluation entails determining the possible worth of products through making judgments regarding their impact on those who use them.

Besides that, according to Laabidi & Nfissi (2016), the assessment of textbooks is a crucial part of the English teacher's job. When it comes to textbook evaluation, most teachers are concerned with textbook selection, or predictive evaluation. Furthermore, according to Lee (2013), evaluating a textbook benefits the field of ELT in two ways. Such that, one component is the teacher's ability to increase his own comprehension of the teaching and learning situation, while the other is the teacher's capacity to contribute clearly in the act of selecting a textbook.

Referring to McDonough and Shaw (2003), they discussed that textbook assessment is a realistic and valuable process since it provides educators with an understanding of the materials' organizational values and assists them in maintaining the field's progress. To follow up, there are strong reasons why textbook evaluation should be conducted. Furthermore, according to Azizifar & Baghelani (2014), there are three primary reasons for assessing textbooks: the necessity to adapt new textbooks; the ability to discover specific strengths and flaws in textbooks by evaluating textbooks; and the consequences of analyzing textbooks may be incredibly valuable for education advancement and professional growth. With the implementation of a new curriculum which employs Outcome-Based Education (OBE) principles, a textbook is urgent to be done.

Brief Theories of Outcome-Based Education

In order to develop high-quality student success, OBE models were first carried out in the United States. In the 1990s, William Spady proposed OBE as a way to refocus formal education on what students learn rather than what they are taught. Outcome-Based Education, according to Spady (1994), focuses and coordinates an institute's entire programs and instructional activities on the clearly specified results we want all students to achieve when they graduate. Moreover, OBE is a cutting-edge performance-based methodology to course creation that provides a strong and appealing way to reform and manage education (Harden, 2007)

According to Glatthorn (1993) and Guskey (1994), the change to OBE was prompted by concerns about the conventional educational system. They have long believed that the traditional educational system's input is insufficient in preparing learners for life and work in the twenty-first century.

Learning results and outcome-based education are high on today's education agenda, alongside OBE (Harden, 2007). Rajae, Junaidi, Taib, Salleh, & Munot (2013) argues that Outcome-Based Education places a strong focus on students actively pursuing and managing their own learning, with lecturers serving only as guides in their pursuit of knowledge. The defensibility of the course's goals, namely the results, and how they can be accomplished through the various steps found in the procedure, is a significant benefit of OBE (Green, Hammer, & Star, 2009; Hager, 2007). The explicitness of its relevance, the capacity for dialogue, intrinsic transparency, accountability, self-directedness, versatility, and an integrated system

of teaching and learning, as well as evaluation, are some of the key advantages of OBE (Davis and Winch, 2015). Moreover, the three aspects of OBE are as follows: first, an emphasis on outcomes; second, a procedure for creating a curriculum that begins with the exit level result and progresses downward; and third, the institution's and teacher's obligation to provide adequate learning opportunities for all students' success (Kaliannan & Chandran, 2012).

While there are a variety of traditional textbook evaluation frameworks, it is critical to choose one that is appropriate for the textbook's methodology and approaches. In this regard, OBE plays a part as a modern curriculum that includes students in the learning process in order to obtain the best results from them. However, textbook evaluation studies which is based on OBE principles barely have been conducted. Therefore, this study looks for the evaluation of a textbook for evaluating dimensions of ICT based integration, intercultural communicative competence, and inclusion in relation to OBE in English textbook.

Method

This research is conducted through library research method. According to Zed (2004), "Library research is a research used library sources to get the data". Using library research method, the data was taken by examining four experts' theories in textbook analysis and OBE principles, namely Spady (1994), Cunningsworth (1995), Ur (1999), and Reiss (2005). Through library research, the data attempts to create instrument for evaluating or assessing Seminar on ELT course Textbook in Undergraduate ELT Program.

Findings and Discussion

In order to evaluate a textbook, there are three dimensions which can be used to measure appropriateness of the textbook, namely content, language, and presentation which was taken from those four theories from Spady (1994), Cunningsworth (1995), Ur (1999), and Reiss (2005).

Table 1. Dimension

Dimension	Sub dimension and Documents/ Experts	Description
1. Content	<p>1.A Suitability with Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019),</p> <p>I.B Materials suitability with curriculum (Cunningsworth (1995); Ur (1999); Reiss (2005); Guideline of ELT Program (2019),Spady (1994)</p>	<p>Textbook should be match with the current curriculum, materials accuracy, and supporting material of learning.</p> <p>-Textbook should provide the complete component, such as student's book, teacher's book, activity book, additional reading material, additional listening material, cassettes for listening, cassettes for pronunciation, video, CALL materials, and other components.</p> <p>-Based on Guideline of ELT Program (2019),:</p>

		<p>should be based on OBE and ELT Program characteristics, i.e. inclusive education, ICT based integration, and intercultural communication</p> <p>-Materials in the textbook provide clear instructions in order to facilitate students' achievement of the intended learning.</p> <p>- Textbooks should have interesting and varied topics and tasks.</p> <p>- Content clearly organized and sequenced by difficulty. Each chapter also provides an introduction and objectives.</p> <p>- The topics are presented in a developmentally logical manner, questions and/or suggested activities develop critical thinking and problem-solving skills, ethnic cultural diversity issues are presented to an adequate degree.</p> <p>-Material in the textbook should have a clear picture of the intended learning outcomes that students are to achieve by the end of the program.</p>
	<p>I.C Learning support materials Pembelajaran (Cunningsworth (1995); Ur (1999); Reiss (2005); Buku Pedoman Pendidikan FIB UB Kurikulum 2019 Pebasis.); Spady (1994)</p>	
II. Language	<p>A. Compatibility with students' level (Cunningsworth (1995); Ur (1999); Reiss (2005); Guideline of ELT Program (2019),</p> <p>B. Communicativeness (Cunningsworth (1995); Ur (1999); Reiss (2005))</p>	<p>Language content includes language form, language use, plenty of authentic language, clear instruction, and the varieties of English.</p> <p>Comprises three sub-components, such as appropriateness with the learners, communicative, the sequential and unity of ideas.</p>
III. Presentation	<p>A. Presentation technique Guideline of ELT Program (2019),</p> <p>B. Presenatation of Learning (Reiss (2005))</p> <p>C. Completeness of Presentation (Reiss (2005))</p>	<p>Comprises three sub-components, i.e. presentation technique, learning presentation, and presentation completeness.</p> <p>Textbook layout determines its overall attractiveness including; length of chapters, size and style, amount of white space, paper quality and color, amount and variety of graphic design features.</p> <p>Textbooks should have appropriate visual material. The book is judged by its cover and a quick flip through pages. It judged by its overall appearance-oraganization.</p>

Accordingly, a robust discussion about three main components is explained thoroughly in the discussion as follows.

Content

A. Material Suitability with The Curriculum

Table 2. Material Suitability with The Curriculum

Sub-Component	Rating				Comment
	1	2	3	4	
1. Curriculum Suitability					
2. Learning Outcomes					
3. Learning Objectives					
4. Material Compatibility					
a. Exposure					
b. Retention					
c. Production					

The first component in the content dimension is material suitability with the curriculum. Based on Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019), the textbook should be aligned with the existing curriculum, provide accurate content, and provide learning support. Compatibility of the materials with the latest curriculum of English education is required for the textbook. Modules should be aligned not only with the existing curriculum, but also with the consistency of the content and learning support materials. Moreover, Reiss (2005) explained that a textbook's content should align with the curriculum and state requirements.

Curriculum suitability aligned with the description of the material. The description of the material should be match with the current curriculum in English education curriculum. Moreover, material suitability with the curriculum also includes learning outcomes as the sub-component in the textbook evaluation. According to Spady (1994), OBE provides a specific picture of the desired learning results for students by the end of the curriculum. Based on Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019), textbook should emphasize the outcomes by the end of the program such as intercultural values, critical thinking, and inclusive education.

Learning objectives are also included as material suitability with the curriculum. A textbook should provide learning objectives in providing student and teacher to achieve objectives by the end of the program. It should be aligned with the Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019). Learning objectives should provide achievement indicators. Moreover, the achievement indicators should be complex. Furthermore, learning objectives also should put the point of the development of students' critical thinking.

Lastly, in material suitability with the curriculum, there is material compatibility. Material compatibility includes exposure, retention, and production. Exposure is intended for learning every articles in the module. For every articles learning, textbook should contain and require student to explore more scientific article from many journals in the intention for students familiar with the articles. Next is about retention. Since the goal of the course is for making scientific article, therefore the textbook should contain the guidance of how making scientific article. Last is about production. As what have mentioned before, the aimed of the course is making scientific article, it means by the end of this program, students should be

able to make their own product. Hence, the textbook should provide more detail on the guidance of how to make scientific article.

B. Material Accuracy

Table 3. Material Accuracy

Sub-Component	Rating				Comment
	1	2	3	4	
1. Review ELT Article					
2. Analyze ELT Article					
3. Arrange a Research Paper					

Another component of content dimension in textbook evaluation is material accuracy. Based on Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019), OBE and ELT characteristics are the subject of material accuracy. OBE and ELT characteristics are inclusive education, ICT-based integration, and intercultural communication.

Seminar on ELT is a course where students can develop their critical thinking to analyse research reports in ELT which are manifested in small-scale scientific seminar presentations through class discussion. The main materials in this course are review ELT article, analyse ELT article, and arrange a research paper. Those materials should align with the Outcome-Based Education principles. In each sub-component, the materials should provide the clear instruction of what student should do. As what Spady (1994) explained that the textbook's materials contain specific guidance to help students complete the learning objectives. This is aimed for the clear outcomes that student should achieve by the end of the program.

To meet the clear outcomes that student should achieve, textbook should provide complete component. According to Cunningsworth (1995), student's book, teacher's book, activity book, extra reading content, additional listening material, cassettes for listening, cassettes for pronunciation, video, CALL materials, and other components should all be included in the textbook. The component of the material also should have varied topics and tasks (Ur, 1999).

C. Learning Support Material

Table 4. Learning Support Material

Sub-Component	Rating				Comment
	1	2	3	4	
1. Authenticity					
2. Intercultural Communicative Competence, Inclusive Education, ICT-based integration					

The last component of content dimension is learning support material. Module topics and activities are included in learning support material. The topics and activities in each module should be varied and interesting. Ur (1999) proposes the criteria for textbook evaluation is various topics and activities to accommodate various learner levels, learning styles, preferences, and other factors. The variety of textbook also should meet the need of the students. Textbook should allow student to be communicative in expressing their opinion, needs, and ideas. Students should be able to express their desires, thoughts, and opinions through language practice

that resembles real-life communication. The nature and content of communicative coursebooks, as well as the arrangement of conversation, style, and appropriacy, can all be seen (Cunningsworth, 1995).

The variety of textbook requires more sources to fulfill the need of the variety of a textbook. More sources will be more variety in the textbook. It also means more communicative topics that students needed in a textbook. Sources are important as a referral. It is crucial to provide the author's biographical details or a link to a legal download. In a textbook, there should be information about the author of source which is shown in the textbook.

Interesting and varied topics and tasks should include in delivering the material. In this era, it is very important to connect the textbook with the technology which have been growing up from day to day. Integrating textbook with technology is not only to represent ICT-Based learning, but it also helps to actualize the learning for all, namely inclusiveness. Textbook should provide knowledge about inclusive education. Besides inclusive education should be included in the textbook, textbook also should give student knowledge about intercultural communication. This is for making the materials more welcoming to students who are from various backgrounds. As well as Ur (1999) explained that textbook should have a variety topics and tasks, therefore it includes material for students who have different level, interest, and type of learning.

Language

A. Compatibility with Students' Level

Table 5. Compatibility with Students' Level

Sub-Component	Rating				Comment
	1	2	3	4	
1. Students' Cognitive					
2. Students' Socio-Emotional					

The first component of language dimension in textbook evaluation is compatibility with students' level. This component includes two sub-components, namely students' cognitive and students' socio-emotional. Language dimension in the textbook should match with the learners' level. According to Reiss (2005), considerate text is a term used to describe textbooks that help students learn by using vocabulary and language structures that are suitable for their age and skill. Cunningsworth (1995) furthermore explained that language content should contain style and appropriacy and varieties of English.

Students' cognitive included as the sub-component of compatibility with students' level. Based on Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019), the language used in explanations and instructions corresponds to the cognitive level of the students. It is essential to make language more available. Language difficulty must be directly addressed.

Furthermore, students' socio-emotional is also counted as the sub-component in evaluating language dimension. Based on Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019), the language used is suitable for teenagers' social-emotional needs. Language in the textbook should have friendly language which is more suitable for students.

B. Communicativeness

Table 6. Communicative

Sub-Component	Rating				Comment
	1	2	3	4	
1. Learnings' Message					
2. Languages' Rules					
3. Coherent Meaning					
4. Coherent Messages					

Communicativeness is the next component in the language dimension. The term "communicative" refers to the use of comprehensible English. The vocabulary used in the textbook should be suitable for the learners. In this component, there are four sub-components such as learnings' message, languages' rules, coherent meaning, and coherent messages. Align with the purpose of ELT Program, textbook should include knowledge about intercultural communication, inclusive education, and the growth of critical thinking of students.

Learnings' message means the message in the textbook can be read by learners. Textbook should present the messages with clearly and understandably for the students. According to Reiss (2005), language in the textbook should improve students' ability by readability level of students. Moreover, not only learnings' messages, there is also languages' rules. Languages' rules aligned with language appropriateness. The textbook should include English rules that are applicable. As well as Ur (1999) explained that in the textbook, all four skills need to be practiced fluently. Cunningsworth (1995) further explained that language material includes grammar, vocabulary, phonology, and the incorporation of pronunciation instruction with other subjects.

Coherent meaning and coherent messages are also the sub-component. Those are the language sequential and unity of ideas. Based on Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019), textbook should provide message or material in the part/chapter/sub-chapter/paragraph/sentence which must be in the chronological order. Moreover, textbook should have coherent messages. This means for the unity of meaning inter part/chapter/sub-chapter/paragraph/sentence. In the part/chapter/sub-chapter/paragraph/sentence, the message or content must be in the correct order.

Presentation

A. Presentation Technique

Table 7. Presentation Technique

Sub-Component	Rating				Comment
	1	2	3	4	
1. Systematic					
2. Chapters' Balance					

The first component of presentation dimension in the textbook evaluation is presentation technique. The subject of presentation technique is learning how to give a presentation. The presentation method itself, learning the presentation, and the completeness of the presentation should all be included in the textbook. There are two sub-components as the indicators for presentation technique dimension. The sub-components are systematic and chapters' balance.

In the presentation technique, it requires a systematic. Textbook should play with the illustration. According to Academic Guideline of ELT Program (2019), materials and activities are described using the opening, content, and closing law in the form of texts, communicative action illustrations, and symbols. The use of illustrations in the textbook is crucial, because it can make textbook look interesting for student. Even though textbook already applied the right pattern and step in order to present the material, illustration takes an important role in the presentation.

Moreover, chapters' balance is needed to make it equal for each chapter in the textbook. Texts, communicative action, image, and symbol are all used in equal amounts to present materials and tasks in each chapter. Balancing the chapter for each textbook is required to balance the explanation, examples and the exercises with the illustrations.

B. Presentation of Learning

Table 8. Presentation of Learning

Sub-Component	Rating				Comment
	1	2	3	4	
1. Student-Centered					
2. Students' Initiative and Creativity					
3. Independence Learning					
4. Evaluation Page					

The next component of presentation dimension is presentation of learning. In this component, it refers to the layout of textbook. The overall attractiveness of a module is determined by its layout. Reiss (2005) explained that the number of pages, size and style, amount of white space, paper quality and color, and the amount and variety of graphic design features all contribute to the overall attractiveness of a textbook. In this component, there are four sub-components. Those sub-components are student-centered, students' initiative and creativity, independence learning, and evaluation page.

The presentation of learning in the textbook should be student-centered. Interaction between learners, between educators and learners, and between learners and the environment is encouraged by materials and tasks in English. Also, textbook should meet with students' initiative and creativity. Textbook should contain materials which are developing initiative, creativity, and students' critical thinking. The material presented in the textbook should enhance students to be more critical and creative based on their innovative.

Textbook should not be only of those two above, but it also should be a media for students to have independence learning. Textbook should help student in developing learning autonomy. Textbook should contain materials and activities which help students in enhancing them to have responsibility for their own education. However, the independence learning should be aligned with the purpose of English education program which includes intercultural communication and inclusive education. Moreover, textbook should contain evaluation page for students. The purpose of this sub-component is for developing the ability of students' self-reflection. The material and tasks in the textbook should reinforce students in recognizing their strengths and weaknesses while learning and communicating. The evaluation page is important for students because it is a place

where students can write about what they have learned over the course of their studies.

C. Completeness of Presentation

Table 9. Completeness of Presentation

Sub-Component	Rating				Comment
	1	2	3	4	
1. Opening					
2. Content					
3. Closing					

The last component of presentation dimension is completeness of presentation. In this component, it talks about visual material of the textbook. Good visual material should be contained in the textbook. According to Reiss (2005), a book's worth is determined by its cover and a quick glance through its pages. It is evaluated based on its overall appearance and organization. The organization of the textbook includes opening, content, and closing which are the sub-component in the completeness of presentation component.

Firstly, in the opening, textbook should contain preface and table of content. The intent, acknowledgement, and expectation of the writer are all communicated to the students in the preface. Moreover, in the opening part, textbook also should provide table of content. The table of contents is a list of information that helps students locate chapters, sub-chapters, and topics within a book.

Secondly, there are several things which should be included in the content part. The first thing is opening. The intent of the textbook, book systematization, learning method, and other essential information for students are all included in the opening. The next thing is learning duties which include meeting, structural exercises, and autonomous activities. Last thing in the content part is references. References contain text, table, picture, number series of picture, table, and references.

Lastly, in the closing part, there are glossaries, bibliography, and index. Glossaries list essential words in the document, along with their definitions, and are organized alphabetically. Then, the bibliography starts with the name of the author, followed by the publication year, the book's title, the place, and the publisher's name. Meanwhile there are two indexes which are for subject and writer. The index for a subject is a list of important terms followed by the appearance of a page number, while the index for a writer is a list of writers whose work is used as a source followed by the appearance of a page number.

Conclusion

As we have seen, in an EFL class, textbook is extremely important. To determine textbook is good or not, it is needed to be evaluated. It is essential to assess textbook. In evaluating the textbook, there should be some criteria which involved in the textbook inventory. This paper discussed the checklist of textbook evaluation based on OBE principles. Based on 4 experts' theories in textbook analysis and OBE principles, namely Spady (1994), Cunningsworth (1995), Ur (1999), and Reiss (2005), it can be concluded that there are 3 dimensions of textbook inventory in relation to OBE principles. Those 3 dimensions are content,

language, and presentation. Content, language, and presentation should all be considered when evaluating textbooks. Each dimension has several components, therefore there are 8 components in this textbook evaluation inventory. Moreover, those main components should be aligned with OBE principles. As a result, textbook inventory will serve as a first step toward concrete transformation of learning resources, making them more welcoming to students and setting the foundation for a greater ability to care for people from a diverse background. The current checklist, as presented in this paper, can be improved through qualitative and quantitative research. Finally, more research is required to correlate the results of the current checklist to those of other well-established instruments.

References

- Azizifar, A., & Baghelani, E. (2014). Textbook evaluation from EFL teachers' perspectives. *2*(1), 24–25.
- Charalambous, A. C. (2011). The role and use of course books in EFL. *Online Submission*, (May).
- Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing your coursebook*. Oxford: Heinemann
- Davis, A., & Winch, C. (2015). *Educational assessment on trial*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Ellis, R. (1997). The empirical evaluation of language teaching materials. *ELT Journal*, *51*(1), 36–42. <https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/51.1.36>
- Glatthorn, A. A. (1993). Outcome-based education: Reform and the curriculum process. *Journal of Curriculum and supervision*, *8*(4), 354–64.
- Green, W., Hammer, S., & Star, C. (2009). Facing up to the challenge: Why is it so hard to develop graduate attributes? *Higher Education Research and Development*, *28*(1), 17–29. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360802444339>
- Guskey, T. R. (1994). Defining the differences between outcome-based education and mastery learning. *School Administrator*, *51*(8), 34–37.
- Hager, P. (2007). Nature and development of generic attributes. *Graduate Attributes, Learning and Employability*, 17–47. https://doi.org/10.1007/14020-5342-8_2
- Harden, R. M. (2007). Outcome-based education: The future is today. *Medical Teacher*, *29*(7), 625–629. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01421590701729930>
- Harmer, J. (2007). How to teach English (Second Edition). *ELT Journal*, *62*(3), 313–316. <https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccn029>
- Hutchinson, T., & Torres, E. (1994). Textbook as an agent of change. *ELT Journal*, *48*(October), 315–328.
- Kaliannan, M., & Chandran, S. D. (2012). Empowering students through outcome-based education (OBE). *Research in Education*, *87*(1), 50–63. doi:10.7227/rie.87.1.4
- Laabidi, H., & Nfissi, A. (2016). Fundamental criteria for effective textbook evaluation. *Efl Journal*, *1*(2), 141–159. <https://doi.org/10.21462/eflj.v1i2.13>
- Lee, S. (2013). The development of evaluation theories for foreign language textbooks. *Journal of Pan-Pacific Association of Applied Linguistics*, *17*(2), 69–89. Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1014790.pdf>

- McDonough, J., & Shaw, C. (2003). *Materials and methods in ELT: A teacher's guide (2nd ed)*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Nunan, D. (1988). *The learner-centred curriculum: A study in second language teaching*. Cambridge University Press.
- Pedoman Akademik Program Sarjana Fakultas Ilmu Budaya Universitas Brawijaya Tahun Akademik 2019/2020*. (2019). Malang: UB Media.
- Rajae, N., Junaidi, E., Taib, S. N. ., Salleh, S. ., & Munot, M. . (2013). Issues and challenges in implementing outcome based education in engineering education. *International Journal for Innovation Education and Research*, 1(4), 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.31686/ijer.vol1.iss4.121>
- Rea-Dickens, P. & Germaine, K. (1992). *Evaluation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Reiss, J. (2005). *Teaching content to English language learners: Strategies for secondary school success*. White Plains, NY: Pearson Education.
- Sheldon, L. E. (1988). Evaluating ELT textbooks_sheldon.pdf. *ELT Journal*, 42(4), 237–246. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc>
- Spady, W. G. (1994). *Outcome-Based Education: Critical Issues and Answers*. American Association of School Administrators, 1801 North Moore Street, Arlington, VA 22209 (Stock No. 21-00488; \$18.95 plus postage).
- Tomlinson, B. & Masuhara, H. (2004). *Developing Language Course Materials*. Singapore: SEAMEO Regional Language Center.
- Ur, P. (1999). *A course in language teaching trainee book*. Cambridge University Press.
- Zed, M. (2004). *Metode Penelitian Kepustakaan*, Yayasan Obor Indonesia.